

- 0:00:00 Kendall Martin: We want this to be a collaborative experience, but most of all we want it to be as inclusive as possible, so in terms of having a question being discussed or having answers and responses from my teammates, we just ask everybody -- just be kind. It's one of those things that sometimes we forget in large part in our lives, but this is an experience that we want everyone to have a chance to talk. It's a conversation. It's not meant to be a presentation or a one-way dialogue.
- 0:00:28 We want everybody to feel included in the conversation, so rules for the road [indistinct] and read it to you, but just know that ultimately we want to make sure that everybody feels welcome. So tonight -- now I wish I had the agenda slide up there -- we have, thank you. We have a reference for the agenda this evening. One of the things that we want to be sure we have time for is we have a presentation from Metro staff surrounding some of the topics that we want to bring forward to the room.
- 0:01:05 We also have a short presentation by our DEQ colleagues that we were scheduling a little bit after our first question and answer session after the Metro presentation. But I want to build some consensus and get to a group approval first and foremost. Perhaps we can do both presentations back to back -- and that enables us to have more dialogue and more question and answer commentary immediately following.
- 0:01:33 So, as a shift in our agenda, if we can do both back to back I think we can get through both presentations in 30 minutes -- or somewhere around that time. First, right here, anybody that would be opposed to us switching our agenda a little bit this evening, we could do those presentations up front. Okay. We're all in agreement. That's our first agreement tonight. So think. We will build consensus there and call it a victory, so 30 minutes of presentation up front, followed by significant question and answering.
- 0:02:05 In terms of how that format and how we're going to work that process -- what I ask you to do is what we all learned in elementary school. If you can raise your hand, I'm your emcee. I'm just going to point to you and have you talk out loud to the room. So if I can ask you just to state your first name first, just so everybody knows your name. But then, if I can just have you get to your question and we'll figure out -- as our group of folks who will be responding -- who is the right person to address your question.
- 0:02:33 If you have a specific question for Metro or DEQ -- if you know that that is precisely who you need to talk to -- feel free to say that. But if not -- if it's just a question that you want our body of staff to be able to address and answer -- you have an opportunity, we're the rabble up here up front. One of our teammates will stand up and address your question directly. So again, we are also recording this session, mostly for our notes in order for us to be as transparent as possible for people outside this room.
- 0:03:02 That means we're going to record your questions, record the responses, so we can generate a transcript that will ultimately and eventually be available to the public on our website. So if there's anybody that's opposed to having their question used in a public session, we have

an opportunity for you. It's called the comment card. This comment card is part of an open comment period about the license renewal on the Metro website. But you also have an opportunity to write your comment on these cards that are available on the back table.

0:03:36 If I can get one of my teammates to hold up one of those cards in the back, we have plenty of comment cards and plenty of pens. So during tonight's session, feel free to fill out one of these comment cards if you have a direct comment based off of what you've read about what's in potentially any license as well. My teammate Hila here is administering the public comment period and our public comments are available to be delivered on line up to November 30th.

0:04:05 If you have any questions, Hila is the person to talk to tonight. If you have questions before you fill out your comment card, please feel free to talk to Hila or any one of my teammates. But we invite you to be part of this process. Again, we thank you for being here. It's a very important discussion. We are glad that you took time out of your busy day to connect with us. In closing, I think one of the first things that we want to talk through is a presentation.

0:04:32 So, in closing, we'll have time during the middle of our transition from Metro to DEQ just for -- we'll have, like, a short break, because you know come on, 30 minutes of presentation, I think you're going to want a break at that point. We'll dive into the questions and answer session. We might have a break in between the presentations but if you need to leave the room, feel free to do so. We just ask you to just honor and respect the person asking the question, okay? So are there any immediate questions we can answer before we get into tonight's session? Okay. Say, none. I'm going to pass it over to my teammate, Hila Ritter.

[cross talk]

0:05:12 Before we start, one last thing. Housekeeping. Who are my teammates? Who are we talking about? I'm going to ask my Metro teammates, first and foremost, to stand up to introduce themselves and we'll gradually go through the people that are going to be responding to your questions tonight. So the first person I'm pointing to is Roy Brower who will introduce himself.

0:05:31 Roy Brower: Hi. Roy Brower, Metro. I'm one of the solid waste program directors at Metro. Glad to see you all.

Warren Johnson: Hello, my name is Warren Johnson. I am the Solid Waste Compliance Manager at Metro, so I'm responsible for the licensing inspection program.

Audrey O'Brien: I'm Audrey O'Brien. I'm with the Oregon Department of Environmental Quality and I'm our Solid Waste Manager, responsible for the permitting of [indistinct].

0:06:07 Jeremy Fleming: Hi, Jeremy Fleming. Solid Waste Permit Manager for DEQ, including Grimm's permitting.

Kathleen Johnson: Hi, Kathleen Johnson. I'm the Community Environmental Health Program Coordinator [indistinct] Washington County Health and Human Services. My primary role there is to work on air quality and its connections to human health -- but mostly particulate matter [indistinct] which is diesel and wood smoke, but also climate change and [indistinct].

0:06:41 Kendall Martin: So we have a terrific team -- oh, I'm sorry. Go ahead.

Man: [indistinct], Metro, Solid Waste Facilities Inspector. Grimm is one of my facilities.

Stacey Hopkins: Stacey Hopkins, [indistinct] support for the public [indistinct] program for the licensing.

Eric Crendall: Eric Crendall, and I'm [indistinct] program support along with Stacey to the [indistinct] team of solid waste [indistinct].

0:07:06 Julie: Julie [indistinct].

Woman: [indistinct]

Kendall Martin: If there are any other elected representatives in the room, this is your moment to stand up to be acknowledged. Anybody that --

Paul Morrison: Paul Morrison, Tualatin City Council.

[indistinct] Davis: [indistinct] Davis, Tualatin City Council President.

Man: [indistinct] Tualatin City Council.

Robert Kellog: Robert Kellog, Tualatin City Council.

0:07:39 Kendall Martin: Fantastic. We have a terrific group here tonight, so without further ado we are going to dive into our session. I'm going to pass it over to my teammate Hila, who is going to walk us through a Metro presentation.

0:07:56 Hila Ritter: Come over here, so I can be the master of my destiny. So, hi, everybody. Thank you so much for being here. My name is Hila Ritter and I'm the authorization coordinator for Metro. And, let's see, I'm going to try and do my notes and the computer at the same time so bear with me. So. We have been engaging together on this topic for a while now and before I jump into the proposed amendments that we are proposing to put into the Grimm's license, I want to give a little bit of context to the conversation.

0:08:31 So, Metro is responsible for overseeing solid waste operations for the Metro region. This map shows the solid waste facilities in and around the Metro region that are part of the solid waste system -- which includes yard debris and compost operations. There's a bigger one in the back, if you want to take a closer look. So, composting is an important part of the waste reduction goals for our region and for our entire state. It's something that we all value.

- 0:09:04 But it has to be done right, and it has to be properly managed. So we are approaching this from the regional perspective. That's why it's critical for us to work in partnership with a wide variety of stakeholders. And that gives us a full picture as to what's going on, especially with you folks in the community. And that's why having your input and your feedback has been instrumental to our process and how we are developing our policy moving forward.
- 0:09:37 So this is our fourth public meeting on this topic, on Grimm's Fuel Company, since last year. And you have stuck with us and reported your experience to us with patience and honesty and a candidness that is really appreciated and really makes a difference for us. So in preparation for this, and speaking with some of the community leaders from organized groups in the area, they've asked me to share that they're seeking a win-win.
- 0:10:11 That they don't want to put Grimm's out of business but they do want a return to livability in their homes and in their neighborhoods. So the organic process of the controlled biological decomposition of yard debris -- or compost -- will always generate some odors.
- 0:10:33 But if the operational process is working well, these odors can be controlled and minimized. I have heard countless times that it never used to be like this, and it doesn't have to be like this. Sorry. So, in addition to working closely with the community and with our government partners we've been in regular communications with the Grimm's management team.
- 0:11:01 And while I'm not here to be their messenger, I think it's important for you to know that they are committed to overhauling and improving their operations. I also think it's important to recognize that changing the course and completely redefining operations for an existing business with 50-60 full time employees is a difficult process, and it's going to take time. It's been an ongoing process for all of you and for all of them, so what has been happening?
- 0:11:32 I'm sure many of you will remember, that in January of this year, Metro hired Green Mountain Technologies to do a site assessment of the Grimm's operation, with an emphasis on odor minimization and to provide us with recommendations for how that facility can improve their operations. So they presented -- Green Mountain Technologies -- presented their findings and recommendations in July, and their report is available on line on our Metro website.
- 0:12:01 Since the report came out, we have been working with our government partners, incorporating feedback from other compost facility operators, and the Grimm's Fuel Company management team to develop a plan moving forward. So we're ready to share those proposed amendments to the Metro license for Grimm's Fuel Company. These proposed amendments will be effective January 1, 2019 and we're here to get your feedback and input on those amendments.
- 0:12:33 The public comment period -- as Kendall mentioned -- is open until November 30. So you can write your comments on a comment card, you can send them in via email or in a letter, and we will accept your written comments for our public record. If you need any

accommodations for that, just let me know, I'm happy to help. So, without further ado, let's get into the amendments.

0:13:01 So, there are 12. And if you've read the Green Mountain Technology report, these will all look really familiar. I'm going to go over the big changes -- these are the 12 that are included in the redline document that is available in a paper copy on the table, and also on line. There are also other changes that are going to go -- small changes -- that will be in the rest of the license. But these are the substantive changes. And they all focus on operational procedures.

0:13:34 So I'm happy to get into the details of any of these during the Q&A. I'm going to let your questions guide how deep into the weeds we go on these. I'm just going to give you a general overview first. And then we'll, we can talk more about it in the Q&A.

So, pile height of 14 feet. We are requiring that by December 31st of '19. So by next year the piles need to be reduced to 14 feet. We are requiring an aerated system.

0:14:02 We're requiring a cover. If you read the Green Mountain Technology report, they talk a lot about a bio-cover. That would be fine. There are other covers that would also be acceptable. But the active composting piles do have to be covered. We're requiring adequate bulk density. Again, if you read the report, this is something that the Grimm's Fuel Company is already doing really well.

0:14:30 And something that we would like them, are going to require them to continue to do moving forward. And that is the porosity of the material in the piles. No disturbance of the piles for 15 days -- that's upon placement into the active composting piles. That's for a lot of reasons, but primarily odor control, and then making sure all the bugs are active and doing their thing and making things work.

0:14:59 Composter training program is another requirement which is going to include continuing education, because -- while they have a great crew of folks over there -- we can all live, learn, and grow. So continuing on here -- the capture and treatment of air. I'm going to come back to this with some pictures in a second. They have recently developed a system that they've implemented on that and intend to carry it forward in their next plans.

0:15:32 Oxygen and temperature levels need to be monitored and recorded and there are other composting monitoring parameters which include -- that are going to need to be tracked and recorded, which include nutrient balance -- which is the carbon to nitrogen ratio; moisture content; aeration; acidity; stability; electrical conductivity; heavy metals; fecal coliform and salmonella; and retention time.

0:16:00 Pathogen reduction needs to be achieved on all compost. Again, if you read the Green Mountain report -- Green Mountain Technologies report -- they talked about PFRP, which is a process to further reduce pathogens. There are a lot of different ways to achieve pathogen reduction, depending on what method of compost you use. So we're not prescribing a certain path, as long as it happens -- pathogen reduction happens at its sample core.

- 0:16:28 And then finally, the new -- the final new requirement is a community engagement plan. This is another one where there are a lot of different ways that it could be approached. We have some recommendations, or suggestions, of ways that it could happen. But there's a lot of different ways and just a note on this is that when you get an invitation -- whether it be for an information facility tour, or to participate in a good neighbor agreement or you know, whatever different options come out of this community engagement plan -- I just encourage you to accept that invitation and to jump in because it's your opportunity to look under the hood a little bit and it's pretty fascinating. At least to me.
- 0:17:21 So, these are some of the due dates that we have as part of our proposed amendments. As you can see, coming up real soon is the Tualatin Valley Fire and Rescue 40-foot pile height requirement, which is by the end of the year. So by January 1 it needs to be in place. The folks over at Grimm's have been working really hard to meet this deadline and it looks like they're going to be able to get there.
- 0:17:51 Sorry. Let me just get rid of that. Okay. Okay good. Sorry. So, an updated operating plan. We're requiring a new operating plan the end of January. So if you've had a chance to read the redline document you'll have probably noticed that a lot of it is relying heavily on the operations plan and that is -- the intent there is that Grimm's Fuel Company is, these are benchmarks that they need to achieve. And the operating plan is going to detail how they're going to get there and what they're going to do.
- 0:18:32 And the operating plan is subject to approval by the Metro COO, and I had a couple of folks point out to me that that wasn't clear. So the COO is the Chief Operating Officer of Metro. So the updated operating plan is due to us by the end of January -- subject to our approval. Community engagement plan. So how they're going to do their community engagement is due to us by March 4th. Doesn't mean that it's necessarily going to happen in that timeline.
- 0:19:03 But they have to figure out how they're going to, and let us know what their plan is, by March. The fire department has the 25-foot pile height requirement by April 30th. And we, again, have our 14-foot pile height by the end of the year. So, as I already said, mentioned -- this has been a long process and we still have a long way to go. I have a few images that I've pulled up -- you can't see the text on the top so I'll walk you through it.
- 0:19:45 But I have a few images that I pulled up that highlight some of the changes that have been happening and these changes have been happening as a direct result of your input and your continued communication and engagement with us and with Grimm's Fuel company. So, this picture was taken in March. And I'm sure that you all remember in February we had one of the worst odor events this area has experienced.
- 0:20:10 When that happened, Grimm's Fuel -- that happened while we had the Green Mountain Technologies was actively performing their site assessments and they were onsite during that time and the Grimm's management reached out to Green Mountain and said "We really need some help. We need something that we can do now."

- 0:20:31 And the recommendation that Green Mountain Technologies gave them was to do a bark chip cover over the top -- which is the lighter area over there, that you can see, to trap in some of the off-gassing that was happening after the pile turning was over. So, it was an attempt to mitigate odors that happened as a result of turning the pile. And I want to call your attention to this conveyor right here, because we're going to come back to that in just a moment.
- 0:21:06 So this is a picture taken in June and it is the air capture and treatment system. So I mentioned that earlier. So this is while it was still under construction. So the conveyors that are going this way were all reconfigured and all enclosed, so that the air coming off of that grinding and screening process is all captured. And these tubes collect the air. They vacuum suck it.
- 0:21:38 It comes down here and these pvc pipes have holes in them. So this is similar to, like, a septic system and then this is still under construction and it gets filled with bio-media -- usually woodchips. So the air from up here that is captured comes down here and gets percolated through the woodchips as the treatment system for the air. So then when the air comes up through the woodchips it is odorless.
- 0:22:05 This is another picture from a slightly different angle, and you can see this is the cement bunker. The pvc pipes are underneath this and this is the wood chip layer. It's kind of hard to see because it's kind of brown on brown but that's what you're looking at in that picture. And then, so this picture was taken last week.
- 0:22:30 Oh, and I forgot to mention, sorry -- in this one you can also see that some of the relic objects from previous iterations of different systems and stuff have been removed from the site. And that was another recommendation from Green Mountain. So the reason that I brought this back up is because -- or, brought this one from last week -- is that you can see this much more of the conveyor system.
- 0:22:59 Granted, it's a different, a slightly different angle as well, but the Grimm's Fuel company has reduced the amount of incoming volume that they're taking from their commercial customers by -- commercial customers can only bring a third of what they brought last year. And they are working really hard around the clock to reduce the volumes of the piles to meet the 40-foot pile limit and move material offsite.
- 0:23:27 They've sent one of their operators to compost school, as part of getting started in that continuing education, and they've spent the last couple of months researching and touring composting operations and comparing ideas with other facility operators and seeing how other systems are working. So the reason that I bring this up is that I want you to know that while it may appear that it's business as usual, things are changing. And they're changing as a result of the input you've provided to us and to the company.
- 0:24:02 So we're here. DEQ is here. The City of Tualatin is here. Clean Water Services, Washington County, Tualatin Valley Fire and Rescue -- figuratively, for some of those agencies -- but we're all here, and we're listening. And we're going to continue to be engaged with you and

with Grimm's Fuel Company, moving forward. So for now, I'm going to hand it over to DEQ and I will be here and available to answer your questions.

- 0:24:38 Jeremy Fleming: Hi, again, Jeremy Fleming, DEQ. So at Grimm's, as you know, has a DEQ -- a current DEQ -- solid waste permit to operate a compost facility. DEQ agrees with Green Mountain consultants and Metro that Grimm's needs to do more to meet DEQ's compost rule performance standards. So, with that, DEQ proposes to modify Grimm's solid waste permit to include, first, the construction of an aerated system.
- 0:25:11 Grimm's is to build and operate a continuous aeration system that provides adequate aeration to maintain minimum oxygen level of 5%. So again like I said let me explain, these are step-by-step [indistinct] these will be new explicit conditions within the permit. Some of these are revisions; some of these are conditions that are required to be in their operations plan.
- 0:25:38 But we are proposing to move these as explicit conditions to the permit. So, first would be a floor stair continuous aeration system. Second, regarding pile height. DEQ will require Grimm's to reduce pile height to meet the fire code and the schedule, compliance schedule, set by Tualatin Valley Fire and Rescue. So that's that 40 feet by the end of the year, then 25 feet. And as a condition of the permit, DEQ will then further require reduction of piles to 14 feet to mirror Metro's requirement.
- 0:26:18 This is to ensure that Grimm's can carry out aerobic static pile composting. The 14 feet we feel is required to ensure aerobic activity, in the active compost pile. Third, regarding bio-cover. DEQ is going to require a minimum bio-cover. Potentially, an alternative bio-cover like Gortex but at this point with the recommendations from Green Mountain, and again these are a work in progress so it doesn't necessarily have to be a bio-cover.
- 0:26:53 But that is required on the active compost pile. DEQ recognizes that this is a best practice among compost facilities to minimize odors on active compost piles, to have a cover. Fourth, this is something that Grimm's is currently doing, but we want to include it as a new requirement or a new condition of the permit, and that is to capture and treat odors from the screening and transfer process.
- 0:27:21 That's the pictures there that Hila just showed that with the construction cover over the processing area, and then exhausting that through a bio-filter, constructive bio-filter. Again, this is something that Grimm's has already completed. And this is something that is going to be included as an additional condition in the permit. Additionally, parameter monitoring -- this is something that's in the permit under the operations plan section.
- 0:27:55 We were going to include it as an explicit condition that DEQ proposes that oxygen, temperature and moisture monitoring are included as an explicit condition of the permit. The new permit condition would set a range for these parameters. So there will be a range for oxygen, moisture content, and temperature that would be explicit and would need to be met as a condition of the permit.

- 0:28:23 Lastly, DEQ proposes to remove the authorization in the current permit for Grimm's to receive Type 3 food waste, and remove the condition that allows food waste pilot project within the permit. This is something we've talked with Grimm's about. They do not in the near future have a desire to accept food waste and so this will be removed and could possibly be added again at a future date but at this time we'd like to remove that pilot project as a condition.
- 0:29:02 So for our next steps, or our schedule for DEQ, we are going to begin on the end of this year to draft the permit modification and initiate a public comment period. And we're aiming to have the permit issued by mid-February. So that's what DEQ is proposing at this time.
- 0:29:28 Kendall Martin: So just as a time check. We are scheduled to be done, or conclude in this session, at 8 o'clock. That gives us quite a bit of time to have questions and answers. My job is to make sure that the flow continues, that there is opportunity for you to fill out one of our comment cards in the back. Feel free to do so during that time frame. If you have a smart phone, or if you have data available, you can also check information on our website -- oregonMetro.gov/grimms.
- 0:30:04 That's a connection point to all the work that Metro's already done in terms of keeping updates and all the information and all of the reports available to you for review. So during this session we invite you to take a look at that information as well. That might even trigger a question that you might want to have us bring forward. So with that, I'm going to open it up. If you have a question, please raise your hands and I will just point to you and I will make sure that your questions are addressed.
- 0:30:36 Man: So, a question for DEQ --
- Kendall Martin: I'm sorry, if you don't mind standing up too.
- Man: -- where did you get the 5% figure. Because I'm looking at the GMT report. The only place it's mentioned, it says "aerated static process [indistinct] have oxygen levels over 16% within the pile, compared to zero to 5% in static piles." So, where did that 5% [indistinct]?
- Jeremy Fleming: The 5% -- well --
- [crosstalk]
- 0:31:06 Jeremy Fleming: So the idea is that the area [indistinct] to be built to be, provide 10% oxygen -- I think that's what the Green Mountain report [indistinct] built to provide 10% oxygen in the pile. And our thought is that to have a hard limit like at 5%. And that, you know, the system built to be at 10%. So that, it's something new.
- 0:31:38 We don't -- other compost permits, we don't put a parameter in actual hard range. Like I tried to describe, it's always been part of the operations plan. If the facility tells us what they want to meet, we approve it. But as I think within Green Mountain's plan, it's understood

that active composting is optimum at 10% or above, and active composting occurs between 5 and 21%. Aerobic composting between 5 and 21%.

0:32:11 Hila Ritter: I know you didn't ask that question, this question, but I want to piggyback on that and say "you'll notice when you read the Metro proposed amendments there's a, we talk about 10% and 5% aeration and similar to DEQ, we're requiring that the system be designed, maintained, and operated to achieve 10% in all portions of the pile. And if it gets at below 5% at any point -- at or below 5% at any point in the pile -- that's when corrective action needs to happen.

0:32:40 So, the system needs to be designed at 10% or better but, you know, if you're taking samples in all parts of the pile, right? And if you get 13% over here, and 10% over here, and 7% over here, and 19% over there -- you know, that 7%, it's okay as long as nothing in the pile goes below 5%. So that's as a point of clarification on the Metro [indistinct].

0:33:08 Jeremy Fleming: This is what we're proposing right now [indistinct] draft, so we appreciate your comment.

Man: Does Green Mountain have an opportunity to review the proposal and see if it is line with what they were [indistinct]?

Kendall Martin: Other questions? Yes.

Woman: I saw a bunch of deadlines on the screen earlier and I'm just curious what happens if they're not met by Grimm?

0:33:39 Hila Ritter: So, for Metro, we have -- we're going to take -- we take a progressive approach to enforcement actions. So our goal is to have the facility be in compliance and so we start with technical assistance and see what can be achieved in that working collaboratively with the facility operator and if that doesn't work then we move forward from there. So, we have these deadlines in place and we're going to be working with the management at Grimm's Fuel Company to make sure that they achieve those.

0:34:14 Woman: Thank you.

Kendall Martin: Other questions. Questions or comment. Let's leave it open, wide open for discussion. Please, yes.

Woman: [indistinct] see you're looking for comment until November 30th, and then you want to have license issued January 1. So are those comments going to be considered in any changes, any alterations made to the license? Or is that just going to be moot comments.

0:34:43 Hila Ritter: Yeah, thank you. So, the question that everybody didn't hear it is are the comments going to make a difference in the drafting of the license? So, the Metro license is still also -- as Jeremy said -- our Metro license is also in draft, so we welcome input. And if there's things that we haven't considered, then we would certainly take those under

advisement. All of these things that we have come straight from the Green Mountain report that we contracted.

0:35:16 And so that is the basis that we've used to come up with these recommendations going forward. But this whole process has been informed by community input, which has been invaluable to us, so yes we would take feedback into consideration. And I would also say that that rule also takes feedback from Grimm's Fuel Company management into consideration, as well.

0:35:46 Man: [indistinct] get the feedback from the question or the comments so if you have [indistinct] through the email before [indistinct] new permit [indistinct] feedback or answer to their question or is -- will they consider their comments, suggestions.

Hila Ritter: Does Grimm's consider?

Man: No. Metro. Metro's --

[crosstalk]

0:36:21 Hila Ritter: Oh. Yeah, thank you, I'm sorry, thank you, Jeremy. Yes. So we do -- yes. Metro does provide a response to comments. So in the staff report that will be associated with the license and will come out shortly after the license, there will be a response to comments. So the facility operator will have an opportunity to respond to comments if they want, and then Metro staff will also have a response to comments. And then that will be published on the website in the same place, in the oregonMetro.gov/grimms.

0:36:54 Man: At the same time, I want to take this opportunity to thank you and all the agencies that participated in this forum -- especially Metro for working to turning the [indistinct] back to our [indistinct] communities while [indistinct] Grimm's in a modern, in a more efficient and cleaner operation. Thank you so much.

0:37:22 Man: I think at the last meeting you mentioned your monitor -- Metro's monitor mailbox or phone number but beginning January 1st, if folks in Tualatin have complaints of smells, odors -- what's the plan for Metro to act quickly respond to an email or phone message. Because you said before they were going nowhere. No one was actively monitoring those mailboxes and the phone number.

0:37:46 Hila Ritter: Yeah, so we've recently created a web form and that is -- there are business cards on the table here. Small little business cards that have the shortcut to the web form where you can submit complaints and your observation -- thanks, [indistinct] -- so -- and yet those come to a general inbox that's shared between several people in this room.

0:38:17 They were always being read and responded to before, but the difference when it was coming to -- and sometimes they still come to an individual, which is okay -- but the difference between using the web form or the general inbox and sending them directly to

me is that every once in a while I do go on vacation or I am sick, I have small children so I'm often out with them. So I may not be able to respond to it in a timely fashion.

0:38:46 So we have always tracked them and recorded them it's just the response time varies pretty significantly if it's coming to an individual as opposed to through the web form or through the general email address, which is monitored by a group of people.

Man: Thanks.

Hila Ritter: Thank you.

Kendall Martin: Other questions, yes sir.

0:39:09 Man: There's been emphasis and concern on the order part of the problem. But how about as far as air quality, and the breathing of the air and its affects on the community. Are there studies? Will there be future studies to monitor? Because, you know, the order could be like the iceberg. It could be bad smell but it could be hiding a lot of more dangerous, you know, dangerous situations in the future. So that would be something that I would be interested in.

0:39:47 Hila Ritter: So the question was -- we've talked a lot about the odors here. But we haven't talked about air quality and the health impacts -- or potential health impacts. And are there any studies that show if there are health impacts and what do those studies say? And I'll just very quickly say that there is very limited information about -- as far as studies -- about composting operations and their impacts on health. And we have worked in partnership with Oregon Health Authority and Washington County Health Department to do literature reviews and try and find those kinds of studies, and they, we have, they have eluded us to date. So there is very limited scientific information that talks about the health impacts from compost operations.

0:40:39 Woman: And DEQ was asked if we would do any kind of monitoring, and at this time we think that -- in consultation with Oregon Health Authority -- that would be such a complicated project to try to do and it might not be conclusive in any case. So DEQ's focusing is limited monitoring dollars on other air quality problems and instead what we're trying to do is focus on what can we accomplish through the DEQ solid waste permit and the Metro license that will address odors and bio aerosols and offsite dust. And then we'll see if there's still remaining concern, and then we would work with our air quality program to evaluate if our air quality program needs to do something more.

0:41:26 Kendall Martin: Yes.

Woman: Being from where I'm located, I've noticed incredible increase in the smell in the past month. Is that because of the active rejection of the pile and should we expect it to get worse before it gets better?

Hila Ritter: Yes. There's several reasons why. Historically, Grimm's Fuel Company has worked really hard to time the turning of their piles with weather patterns.

- 0:42:01 And when the eastern wind is blowing, that's when they go, that's when they turn -- as much as possible -- to reduce impacts on their distant neighbors. Right now, because they are under these tight deadlines of reducing their piles, they're just going all the time. So it is in the -- there is no consideration of which way the wind is blowing. It's just operate all the time to move the material through. So, yes, it is -- that is one reason.
- 0:42:32 I also understand that seasonally, with the air patterns changing, that that is also implementing and that the fall season is always a difficult time for odors at compost facilities because of the way that the air is working or not working in their favor. So that's also a factor. And then I -- is it going to get worse before it gets better? I don't know. I'd like to hope that we've gone through the worst. And that we're on the getting better end of the spectrum. That's my hope.
- 0:43:12 Woman: How will we know that they're turning a pile, though. Will that be a part of the community engagement plan? So that when we do see an influx of that kind of odor, that can overwhelm our neighborhood -- that we can go somewhere and see what they're proactively doing at that time, or if it's just the seasonal thing?
- 0:43:34 Hila Ritter: Yeah, that's a great question and something I think to consider for the community engagement plan. I think that's a great idea. I do know that in the past, that the management at Grimm has sent out notices to neighbors that they're regularly in contact with, letting them know that hey we're going to be turning the piles. They're not doing that right now because they're just cranking all the time, right now. But I imagine -- I mean, that's been their past practice for decades so I imagine that they would return to it.
- 0:44:13 Woman: Thanks for being here. I feel like we're frenemies. [crosstalk] I was interested in the license agreement that you crossed out words that are strong like "control" and "prevent" and you chose to use "minimum" or in some way a form of the word "minimum" at least 12 times if I counted correctly.
- 0:44:44 And then I was wondering how are you defining "minimum?" Because if you're going to minimize odors, will it be from 10 o'clock at night to four in the morning? And so maybe all of our windows will be closed and we won't smell it. Or are you going to minimize it from the level 10 that it's constantly at? I smell the same thing everywhere I drive. I work in the community. I live in it. Are you going to minimize it from a 10 to an 8? Because you minimized it. Or is it going to be seasonal? What does "minimize" or "minimal" or "minimum" really mean?
- 0:45:20 Hila Ritter: Great question. Let me get the first part first and then I'll get to the minimum part second. The reason we have moved away from the preventing of off-site malodors -- which is what we had in our most recent license -- is that we realize that that's not something that's attainable, because compost operations are always going to create odors. And the odors are indicative of what's happening in the process. So there are odors that tell you what's going wrong and where it's going wrong and you can use that as an analysis to figure out what your problem is and to correct your problem at the source.

0:46:00 Then we also want to have our language nearer the DEQ more closely, so that we are stronger together and have more consistent language between our licenses. So the "control" and "minimize" is getting at the root cause -- you know, the root of what's happening as onsite operations. So saying that they have to prevent all odors offsite at their facility is not something that we can enforce and it's not a realistic thing to have in the license. So that's why we've moved to the "control" and "minimize."

0:46:41 Person: Other facilities are doing that. Other facilities have that no offsite smell -- so it is attainable.

[cross talk]

Woman: Technically if you go from a level 10 odor to a level 8, you've minimized.

Hila Ritter: Yeah, so to speak to that point, the minimize is all the time. It's not just at certain times of the day or from --

Woman: Certain seasons.

0:47:08 Hila Ritter: Yeah, certain seasons, it's all the time. It has to be controlled and minimized at all times and if there is something, there is an upset that is happening, that has to be corrected.

Woman: I'm just really nervous about that word "minimum" or "minimize." Because it's really a wide open, vague, very can-be-read-into --

0:47:29 Man: Yeah, I can speak a little bit. So it's not decreased, it's minimized [indistinct] change the process to an aerobic compost style that would minimize the odors of that composting material. So [indistinct] how we can have conditions, change their process, to minimize the odors.

0:47:50 Woman: So, I moved in the neighborhood three years ago and it was, it was -- I could handle that. Here we are three years later and it's killing us -- literally, I think, in some ways. I don't care if DEQ doesn't think that there isn't any study or whatever. People know how they feel and people are sick and this is my voice and I think it's part of that. And even my neighbors that have been there for years -- 15 years -- "Oh yeah, we used to smell it once or twice a year." And I don't know why, in the year 2018, we can't get back there. So I think some of the verbiage and the language can be, could be stronger.

0:48:32 Hila Ritter: Yeah, so the reduced -- the piles have never been as big as they are now -- right? And so that's the thing that has changed. What has changed and made it so bad right now -- well, the pile size has just become enormous. And so we need to reduce those piles. That's the very first thing. And reducing those piles is going to bring us to a place where the materials and the composting process can be controlled.

0:49:03 Right now, it's clearly not working. Otherwise we wouldn't all be here in this room. So that's why we need to bring it back to how it used to be, and far better -- because it hasn't been down to 14-foot pile heights in a long time.

0:49:23 Woman: I just want to go on record as saying that, I mean, it's sad that it had to take this much effort on the part of the neighborhood and the neighbors and the suffering the odors and the dust for these last couple of years. We pay our taxes, Metro and DEQ and everybody, and a lot of people have put in a lot of work -- including all of you. But all of the neighbors, too.

0:49:51 I feel like -- so it shouldn't even have to reach this point. It should just be litigated, because it should be. It's the right thing to do. And it should be. I don't want to move to another community. I love you guys all dearly but I'm tired. Right? And I don't know how much more we have to say and engage and write emails and make phone calls and -- yeah. So, thank you for your efforts.

Kendall Martin: All the way in the back. Did you have a question first?

0:50:22 Woman: I'm curious about the height of the piles because in talking with composters from around the state, after having some conversations with neighbors, we convened a meeting with the composting -- a big chunk of people in composting industry, some of the folks from DEQ attended that. And it seems to me that -- with what I've heard from them -- is that they're getting in more material than they can get it back out, in terms of actual volume. And so did that come up at all as you were going through this process of -- sort of the needs of the industry versus the needs of the community.

0:51:00 [indistinct] the need to recycle. Yeah. Materials coming in -- and then not enough purchasing or movement of material going out. So what happens where there's nowhere to put the material? What is Metro's thoughts on that as [indistinct]?

Hila Ritter: There's a couple of things in there. So anecdotally compost operators have told me that there's a very short window of time when folks buy compost. And it's basically four months.

0:51:28 But it's a year-round operation to produce that product and we are going to be working towards developing regional standards for composting facilities going forward for all of the composters that are in the Metro region. And one of the things that we're going to be considering when we look into that is how we can incentivize using the material. So, is it in construction projects? Is it in roads projects? Is it in parks projects? Where are the opportunities to market the material? And to use the material? So that is something that is on deck to be looked at. Yeah. But thank you.

0:52:15 Kendall Martin: I'm going to work my way, the gentleman next to her.

Woman: Kendall can we just [indistinct]?

Kendall Martin: Yes, please do.

0:52:20 Woman: So, thank you for those questions. The one thing that DEQ appreciates is the report that Metro had Green Mountain develop and that report identified that if Grimm's goes through and goes to this aerated composting system, they will be able to continue to take the feed stocks in the quantities that they were, and more, and they should be able to do it using a better [indistinct] that will ensure that there aren't impacts to the neighbors that [indistinct].

0:52:54 Hila Ritter: [indistinct] There needs to be modernization [indistinct] so appreciate [indistinct].

Kendall Martin: Sir, you're next and I'm going to start with [indistinct].

0:53:12 Man: I just -- a point I want to make -- before there's any approval of any kind of additional industries [indistinct] or anything like that, I believe the business needs to invest the money in the process and see if it's working. There shouldn't just be an approval based on "you do this, what Green Mountain says, plan a, b, c, d, whatever." We need to have some results, some physical results before there's any kind of approval by the City of Tualatin [indistinct].

0:53:44 Hila Ritter: So there isn't -- at this point there haven't been any requests for additional land use or different land use, for the Grimm's property.

Man: But there's a renewal in this use permit approval.

Hila Ritter: Okay, well, we might be mixing up terms a little bit here. So, we are extending the Metro license for an additional -- extending the term of the Metro license --

Man: You've already done that, right?

0:54:13 Hila Ritter: So, we renewed it and now we are showing you our proposed amendments to amend the license to extend it and include these additional things. So, the existing license, we're adding these things and extending the term for four more years. With the DEQ permit, it's a similar situation where they have a permit in place. They're adding new things to it and I don't know if you're extending your timeline or not -- not extending your timeline, just adding new things. Thank you.

0:54:42 Man: I'm just saying that none of this from any government agency -- DEQ, Metro, and the City of Tualatin has to approve this [indistinct] from my understanding. None of that should be done until Grimm's does the investment, does the work, maybe works with the state of Oregon to get some kind of low modernization grant or something like that. But there shouldn't be a four-year extension, without any kind of real work done, invested. So the community doesn't have to smell this crap any more.

0:55:19 Hila Ritter: So, Grimm's Fuel Company takes about 65% of the region's yard debris. So that's the entire region. So if they were to stop accepting incoming feedstock -- which is something

they are considering in order to do these changes -- if they were to stop accepting feedstock, 65% of the yard debris in the region wouldn't have anywhere to go and be processed. The other facilities that are in the region are already maxed out. So it's important to preserve composting capacity in the region, so that when your yard debris gets picked up at your curb, it still picks up at a rate that is affordable to all of the rate payers in the region.

Man: So maybe an extension of 12 months versus four years.

0:56:06 Hila Ritter: And that's a great point. That's what we did before. We extended it for six months and then we extended it for 12 months. The reason that we're looking at a longer-term extension at this point is because of the significant site infrastructure improvements that Grimm's Fuel Company is intending to do.

0:56:25 Man: Yeah, but intending is not just one thing. We need to have -- we've been dealing with this since 2011, you guys. I've owned a home in Pony Ridge for 21 years. Nothing's been done, except it's gotten worse and worse and worse. Okay? So you guys are newcomers to this, and it's only because we had to do what Julie's talking about -- get in an uproar, become enraged about this issue, because our elected officials have done nothing about this.

0:56:58 Okay? So you guys need to listen to the consumers, the citizens of Tualatin. Okay? Not just one business owner. Jeff needs to step up to the table. It's a three-generation family business. They need to step up to the table and become compassionate capitalists.

0:57:16 Hila Ritter: Sure, and I will just point out that they are also -- they are their own business, right? And they have 50 to 60 employees who are relying on them for their wages in order to have their own viable living. And then there's a lot of landscapers and other small businesses that also rely on them to continue to operate.

Man: So let the free enterprise system work. Let the free enterprise system work.

0:57:41 Hila Ritter: If we were to pull the plug on that, then all of these folks would need to find a new outlet and would need to be able to go other places.

Man: And the market would make that happen. The market would make that happen.

Kendall Martin: It's a very complex -- I want to make sure we get as many questions as possible. Sir, in the hat. You still have a question?

Man: I had a question about what's the expected result of the odor mitigation? Are we expecting odor reduction over the travel that the odor takes? Or is the distance that the odor travels just going to be less at the same odor, particulate matter, whatever?

0:58:19 Hila Ritter: Both. Yeah. So if I understood your question right, your question was are there going to be less frequent --

Man: How much less are we expecting? How much less travel distance are we expecting for it to go?

0:58:37 Hila Ritter: I mean, I can look in my crystal ball but there are different kinds of facilities out there. They have -- composting is always going to generate some odor. And like I said earlier, that odor tells you how things are working in their process, if they're working or if they're not working and something needs to be changed. So there is always going to be some odor with compost facilities so --

0:59:00 Man: You're going from 40 feet to 14 feet. What can we expect from that? What do you think is going to happen? Is it going to be half the amount of odor that we get now, or is it just not going to travel as far and still be as potent?

Hila Ritter: You know, honestly, I can't answer that. I think it will be similar to how things -- as I've heard anecdotally from a lot of folks -- how things used to be, where it's infrequent and fleeting.

0:59:30 Man: I was just going to say that if these changes are made, to move from mostly anaerobic composting to aerobic composting, the whole biological process is different and the compounds generated are different. Anaerobic compost generates more what are considered malodors and aerobic composting generates [indistinct] you know compounds that are not as malodorous. And so again I think just the quantity or volume of odors will be different compounds and with this process I think a lesser quantity volume. But I would expect the intensity and the distance to decrease.

1:00:12 Woman: We've only been here since 2016, but my question is how did you allow this to happen. I mean, it was like, you started out at a lower pile level, I'm sure. How did you get up to 80 feet? Was there nobody watching this process, like DEQ, the fire department, Metro? Were you guys not watching what was going on here, and letting it happen?

1:00:40 Hila Ritter: The Metro license has been in place -- I have to double check the date, for sure how long Metro has had authority over the site. I think that there's a lot of reasons why the pile has gotten so big. Part of it is the urbanization of the metro region and landscaped lawns just produce a whole lot more material that needs to go away, to be managed. So that, combined with -- I mean, the reality is that we sometimes work in silos and we aren't the best at communicating with each other and we didn't know about the fire code pile height limits.

1:01:22 And that was something that they historically hadn't enforced. And they talked about the reasoning behind that at a couple of meetings prior -- it was an interpretation of their code, a code change that had happened and their interpretation of that and when they revisited it -- upon our request, they determined that in fact compost facilities do meet these 25 foot and then 150 width and 250 in length dimension requirement. There's a lot of reasons. And then also they've continued to grow and to accept more material and have a low tip fee.

1:02:11 Person: But they had a limit already. The reason it's got like this is because Metro wants it like this. If you look on Metro's webpage today, this meeting isn't even on there. So it shows the priority that Metro has. This is not a priority for Metro. The priority for Metro is to have a lot of this going on. Okay? It's not about the concern of the citizenship.

Hila Ritter: I'm going to respectfully disagree, it is on the Metro website. This meeting is on the website.

Person: I mean the Facebook page, sorry -- it's not on the Facebook page at all. No notification.

1:02:43 Man: I just want clarification. You mentioned that one of the reasons that the piles were getting very high is because they were accepting so much it was getting maxed out. Now, if I remember, in one of the previous meetings I heard that there were other facilities but they closed down. So those facilities closed down because they were forced to close down, they were a danger, and then we're getting just now the -- and I totally understand that, from Grimm's point of view. If you run a -- I'm a businessman. If you're running a business and your business is growing, it's more profit, livelihood for your employees.

1:03:29 But I think auto manufacturers are a little more powerful and a little more, you know, entrepreneurial -- there's no more leaded fuel any more. They had to make a change. They had to go to unleaded. Today it isn't even a conversation. It's a period of adjustment but it has to happen. The period has to happen. It can't go on like this.

1:03:52 Hila Ritter: The Green Mountain Technologies report talks about the other reason for why their volume has increased so much. In recent years was the closure of the [indistinct] mill in Newburg. So the paper plant in Newburg also accepted yard debris.

Man: They were burning that, right? That was not compost and that was burning it for generating heat?

1:04:21 Hila Ritter: Right. And so when that facility closed in Newburg there was a pretty significant increase in the volume that came to Grimm. And if Grimm's were to close and all of that volume were to go to somewhere else, then it's someone else's neighborhood that is having these impacts that have happened here. And so we are working really hard to fix the problem here and not spread it out.

Man: [indistinct]

1:04:49 Woman: So earlier you had mentioned that there was a discussion about what "minimized" means and there was a comment from up here about we're moving away from the word "decreasing" and going to "minimize" and that kind of thing and you made a comment about DEQ and Metro working together to make their language more similar. And my concern about that is this.

1:05:14 As someone who works with contracts on a daily basis and legal documents and is very familiar with how rule making works, the teeth of enforcement is going to rely upon the language that you have in your license. And if Metro is going to reduce the strength of its language to meet the more less strong, or weaker, language that DEQ has had over the years -- because it took us years, as one of the citizens involved in this -- to get DEQ to believe us, that there was even a problem.

1:05:48 And so if their own rule making and policy leads them to the place where it's taken us this long to get here with them at the table, I'm concerned about Metro coming down to that level. I want to see stronger enforcement and teeth in these documents. Not only because of that but because if the city were to make any changes to the conditional use permit we're going to be looking to the new language that is created through this process. And if there is not strong language what good will it do?

1:06:24 Hila Ritter: that's a great point, and I would just add that what we had before was that they had to prevent odors leaving the premises of their facility. And that does not have any teeth, because that's not something that is enforceable because that's not something that we can control or take action on. What we can take action on is whether or not they're controlling and minimizing the odors and doing odor control measures on site. So that has actual teeth, whereas saying that they have to prevent odors is -- compost facilities are always going to generate odors.

1:07:04 Woman: We'll take a sweet smelling odor. Right? And it can be done.

[cross talk]

Hila Ritter: And to that point, we had the language specifically said 'prevent malodors" and we removed the "malodors" because "malodor" is a subjective term. What is malodor to me may or may not be a malodor to you. And so we need objective language and objective criteria. It gives us more tools in our toolbox to be able to have teeth -- as you say -- and to be able to enforce and follow through.

1:07:39 Woman: "Minimize" is not objective. It's so subjective.

Woman: I would say that the --

Woman: Can I comment on the DEQ permit?

Woman: Can I just make this one statement? I'd like to see the language in these documents avoid weasel words to get around stuff so that nobody has to take any action if there's a problem. Because that's what I'm hearing right now.

1:08:01 There's going to be a lot of weasel words that say "Well, that's subjective and this is objective" or "We don't really think that that means this" and "this means something to someone else, so therefore it doesn't count." Nothing's going to happen if there's a problem. We need to see something strong.

1:08:24 Woman: So, I think we agree with you and that's why we wanted to go forward with making the DEQ permit modifications and to make our permit stronger than it has been. And removing some of the language from the permit that said "hey put this into your operations plan" instead of putting permit conditions into the permit. And those are enforceable conditions. So thank you for your comment and your recommendation.

Kendall Martin: I'm sorry, Ted next and then you.

1:08:58 Ted: Okay. In this new permit I would like to see the amount of [indistinct] be allowed per facility's handling capability. Right now it's big and it's open -- you know, 200 pounds, one thousand pounds, or [indistinct] -- it doesn't say anything. It has to be some material as how much they should be able to take in and that should be the [indistinct] due to composting equipment, established [indistinct] -- all of these should be part of the equation.

1:09:37 And as Dan said, are you [indistinct] that the Grimm's show improve of a new operation on a smaller scale first, before we grow and take [indistinct] material. And then, actually, all that we're talking about -- this has been repeated over and over, that the only protection is subjective and therefore no consequences predicted to repeated [indistinct] polluters. And that being considered as a violation. I argue this solution.

1:10:22 As we see all that is being repeatedly [indistinct] facility. So I think that minimization and control is subjective and it's ineffective. Right now, Grimm's is doing the minimization and control. What else is there between that one and this one? So and one other thing that Howard mentioned is okay, now the new system comes on. And everything is working.

1:10:59 But you still think, still you're going to have some smell. Okay, who is going to pay for my [indistinct]? I bought the house 20 years ago and it didn't have any smell. Ten years ago, I didn't have any smell. Eight years ago, I didn't have a smell. And now I can't live in my house. So this -- somebody has to pay for that. And now it isn't accepted to say that "Oh, you're going to have some smell anyway because all of the compost over there, facilities, they smell."

1:11:32 So when is the real [indistinct]? That's my point. And it should be kind of [indistinct] we think 50 [indistinct] after this one is okay. If you stay at the 99 West, that's fine, to be there. But if you go to [indistinct], no that's not okay. We need some kind of language, or rules and regulations to limit that. And I think if all the agencies come together they should be [indistinct], they should be able to do that.

1:12:10 Woman: Curious. Once this license goes into effect, are there going to be consequences if they don't meet the rules and regulations that are in the permit? Like, what if they don't get to a 14-foot pile by December 31st of next year, for example? It's 15 or 16. Are there going to be consequences?

1:12:41 Warren Johnson: I'll have to speak to that. So, I think Hal mentioned I'm Warren, Metro. So I have a [indistinct] that our goal is to get compliance, right? So we don't like to take

enforcement with a heavy hand if something else would work. But if something else doesn't work, then enforcement is an option. So we try to figure out what the best thing to do to get the result we want fastest.

1:13:08 So that could be working with the operator, that could be firing the operator, that could be suspending requirements -- so it really depends on what the situation is. We don't have set schedules, like if they miss that date it's a thousand dollar fine. We have to think about what's going to happen and the fastest way to get there. So I think enforcement's definitely an opportunity, we can penalize, we can suspend operations, there's lots of things we can do. I don't know what we plan to do, depending on what they do. It really depends on what the situation is and what's going to get compliance quickest.

[cross talk]

1:13:53 Warren Johnson: I'll be happy to answer your questions.

Woman: So does Metro have the authority to issue fines, like DEQ can?

Warren Johnson: Yes. Yes, we do. I'm sorry, sir, please.

Man: You understand if citizens have skepticism? Because Metro hasn't done that since we've asked. It's been at least seven years that I know about. So why should we believe you now?

Warren Johnson: I'm sorry if that's the case.

Man: It is the case. That's the facts.

1:14:19 Warren Johnson: I'm telling you, that's what we have. We have the opportunity to do a lot of things. We have a progressive approach and we try to figure out what the best way to achieve the compliance would be, right?

Man: So, I'm asking you how can we have that faith in Metro, when they haven't proven that?

Warren Johnson: Well, I'm telling you right now that's what we plan to do. So. I hope you believe us [indistinct].

[cross talk]

1:14:50 Man: One of the things, I guess, that we're bringing to bear on this -- first of all, good question, good conversation. We wanted, in order to put the new license into place, we wanted to have a third party objective analysis who is also an expert in this area make recommendations so that -- you may understand, we chose to take enforcement on some of the previous conditions that are in the permit or are in the license. We could have been challenged, we could lose, we could not move the ball forward.

1:15:35 So we determined it was very important to get this expert to come in, make these recommendations so that as we put these license conditions in place -- which many of these are brand new, they're not being imposed on other compost facilities around the region -- but they're going to start to serve as the basis for standards for all the facilities in the Metro region.

1:16:02 It's just unfortunate that Grimm's happens to be more closely located to residential areas than a lot of these other compost facilities. So I think while we have a progressive enforcement path, we also have an iterative way to modify the license if all of these things come to pass and all these conditions are being met and we still have a problem, we will make changes to the license itself conditions that are there. So I understand --

1:16:39 Man: Let me ask you a question related to that.

Man: Sure.

Man: In that meeting with Green Mountain they literally have a a, b, c, plan one, plan two, plan three or abcd option, right? So let me ask you -- has Jeff, has Grimm's fuel said "Okay, we'll do a, we'll do b, we'll do c, we'll do d" and they had monetary estimates on those plans - - or have they tried to manipulate and say "Well, we'll do this but we don't want to do this, we'll do this." Have they tried to take the expert advice and say "Well, yeah, it's really not the experts, we don't want to do that." Can you tell me that answer?

1:17:23 Man: Well --

Man: I mean, it's a simple answer.

Man: When the report came out, following any of the four options that were proposed would have the same result. It's a matter of cost and method.

[cross talk]

Man: Okay, right, so they said the one, two, or three, it's like there's our choice, we're going to choose a, b, c, d -- or did they say they want to try and change some of those things. That's my understanding.

1:17:49 Man: We did not ask them to choose one of the four.

Man: But they're the experts. You telling us that Green Mountain is the expert --

Man: What we intended to do is pull out the principals behind the four options and put those into this license. Our belief is that if they follow the conditions that we put into the license -- whether they're doing a circular model or a pile model or a wind --

1:18:14 Man: My understanding at that meeting, and I saw that meeting, I was there for the whole meeting -- it was very detailed, what was supposed to be done. It wasn't like a concept. It was very detailed what should happen. And they had a [indistinct] map obviously so it was very detailed to get that [indistinct] cost estimate.

Man: Sure.

1:18:33 Man: So, my understanding is that Jeff is trying to manipulate all that instead of taking the advice of the experts Metro paid how many thousands of dollars, and tens of thousands of dollars, to get that expert advice --which is our tax money, by the way.

Man: Well, it's money that the ratepayers pay into the system.

[cross talk]

Man: Exactly.

1:18:57 Hila Ritter: I'll take that question. So, yes. They are looking into it. They are picking it apart. They're doing their own analysis of it. They've had continued dialogue with Green Mountain. They've also, as I mentioned earlier, spent two months touring around to other composting operations in Oregon and in Washington to understand what their operations are like, to see what good ideas can be transplanted and what can't.

1:19:22 And looking at -- they had also proposed a pilot, which speaks to what Ted was speaking of earlier -- they had proposed a pilot operation that was completely different than all four of the options that were proposed -- similar, very similar, but a different company and a different system. In order to get that pilot system to work on their lot they needed to get additional land use approval and that's not something that we're willing to pursue at this time so we -- so that pilot idea was scrapped. So to answer your question, yeah.

1:20:01 They've taken that report. They've taken a deep dive into it with the contractor on their own time. And then they've also picked it apart and looked at other ideas and other options. And it's their business. I mean, they are welcome to figure out a way -- as long as they are meeting these recommendations that came from our expert third party, they don't have to follow any one of those four things.

1:20:24 They could do a fifth option that is completely different as long as they are on an aerated system, as long as they have their piles under 14 feet, as long as those piles are covered, as long as they are meeting pathogen rejection and meeting all of these other 12 things. So they may not take one of these four options. And the other thing that I would say about those options is to keep in mind that those estimates and those timelines are all based on bare ground timelines.

1:20:48 And at Grimm's Fuel Company, they literally have to move a mountain first. And then they can break ground and build a construction and start those projects. So keep that in mind when you're looking at those timelines and at those costs. Those are bare ground. Sorry.

Kendall Martin: As a time check, it's now 7:25. We have till 8 o'clock but we don't necessarily have to go till 8 o'clock. So keep this discussion going. We have a question here, and a question in the back next.

Woman: Sorta kinda.

Kendall Martin: Sorta kinda.

1:21:19 Woman: So, just to be blunt about the whole thing. We've got really ambiguous statements. We have kind of a legal nightmare going on. It's kind of a "Well you can do this and you can't do that." It might minimize it, [indistinct] control. I don't think a four-year license is appropriate. I think it's extremely premature. I'd really like to see it shortened up. We've got to see what's really -- or else you guys are just disregarding the citizens.

1:21:50 Hila Ritter: Well, thank you, and I would just encourage you to put that in formal comment in writing for us. And we will definitely take that into consideration. And I'll just say that the reason we are going at this point proposing to do, to extend it for the full term which would be an additional four years to the year that we're currently in, is because -- in order to do these capital improvements, they have to get a lot of loans. And bank loans like to see stability.

1:22:20 And one of the things that they look at is what their authorizations are and how long are you for sure going to be in business so that we know that we are going to get a return on this investment. So the longer time licenses are actually something that our third party expert recommended. They recommended that we do a ten-year license. So, as we've said, all of these things that we're doing are all based on that expert opinion and on that report that we've paid for and had done. And they recommended much longer-term licenses, which means our doing --

1:22:57 Woman: With those plans, though, that they outlined. They said, third party said we have plan a, b, c, d for ten years. Those aren't chosen yet. And they may be bastardized. So I think four years is -- holy cow, what a legal nightmare.

Hila Ritter: Well, the other thing to keep in mind is that similar to what we're doing right now, we have full authority to amend the license at any time. We can also, as Warren said, we can also suspend the license. We can also terminate the license at any time. So, it's not a four-year carte blanche.

1:23:33 Man: I appreciate all the work you've done, definitely. But you're talking out both sides of your mouth. If they're going to get a loan and say -- and I understand, I'm in the real estate industry and financing -- that could help Jeff. But also, if his bank he's supposed to get some money from knows that you can pull their license at any time, then that you know -- you're talking out both sides.

1:24:03 So it doesn't make sense that it's more on our side that you should only do a one year or six month approval versus four years. Does that make sense? I mean that's very black and white right there. Right? What you're saying about is it's good for him, four years for the bank -- that's a little bit of a cop out answer, for me.

Woman: I just, you know, I heard on the high end modernization's about a million and a half dollars, roughly, to get that done. And I get, that's a capital outlay -- however you can do an active million and a half dollars --

Woman: That's on the low end.

1:24:42 Woman: On the low end, whatever. That's a million and a half, the number I heard. But that's a lot of money, even if it's [indistinct]. I guess I wanted to ask Metro, you've got a housing bond right now on the ballot and you're wanting to build more units and what I heard you say tonight is they're taking 65% of the region's waste and your main job is waste management. [indistinct] Metro.

1:25:06 This is not an ordinary business if they're providing this kind of service because when the Newberg facility closed and stopped taking wood pallets they ended up back in the landfill, right? Because there wasn't a place to sort of process those for a while. And so the question I have is that they're an infrastructure business, why isn't Metro just stepping up to the plate to make an infrastructure grant and use the dollars to facilitate response. Because if they closed tomorrow, the smell would go away.

Man: That's a great question.

Woman: That's a great question.

1:25:35 Woman: Where would all the materials go. And if we're talking a couple million dollars, given Metro's budget and you have grant-making authority, you know -- why isn't Metro stepping up to help you partner in this financial [indistinct].

1:25:47 Hila Ritter: That's a great question, and thank you for asking it. So we recently launched our Investment and Innovation program. It's a pilot program that's in place for three years where there is \$3 million on the table per year. Solid waste businesses -- so recycling, compost, and garbage businesses can apply to those grants. They can apply for small grants up to \$50,000; they can apply for up to \$500,000 per cycle. So that's per year, for a total of three years they can apply for up to \$500,000.

1:26:16 And Grimm's Fuel Company had submitted an application for that program in the Fall, end of the summer, and they were -- the way that we have our grant program set up is that there's a pre-proposal process and we had 67 applicants in the initial process and then we brought it down and we invited the next group to submit full proposals and in that process there was 23 businesses were invited to submit full proposals, and Grimm's Fuel Company was one of those businesses that was invited to submit a full proposal and they withdrew

their application because they felt that they were not in a place, a competitive place, at this time.

1:27:05 So we have that program in place and we are eager to fund garbage, recycling and composting businesses, existing and innovative. That's why it's called Investment and Innovation. We want to invest in our existing infrastructure, and invest in innovation for garbage, recycling, and compost. So we have money on the table and we encourage them to apply again next year in the cycle.

Woman: Is that criteria published online somewhere we can see it?

1:27:33 Hila Ritter: Yeah, on the Metro website. If you search Invest and Innovate -- Investment and Innovation on the Metro website, it's all there.

Woman: Could you explain a little bit more clearly why did they withdraw?

[cross talk]

Kendall Martin: We'll finish this response because we had a question in the cue already.

1:27:58 Hila Ritter: Because they are not prepared to enter a competitive proposal for this funding cycle, was what they told us. That's what they told us. They were not prepared. My understanding is that there were difficulties in getting construction bids because there is a -- the economy right now, there is a lot of construction happening and it's very difficult to get contractors to come on site and make bids. That part is speculation. I'm going to put that out there right now. That's my understanding. What I know is in this letter that was submitted when they withdrew their application -- that said that they're not prepared to enter a competitive proposal.

1:28:35 Woman: That's why we can't have passive language in giving them a four-year [indistinct] they are not committed. That is a lack of commitment. I don't understand that. And why are we finding this out now at the end of this meeting. I mean, that really colors the picture, doesn't it?

1:28:54 Hila Ritter: Yes. I think that it certainly could be interpreted that way, and I'm not going to disagree with you because I can't. But I would also just say that while their report was done and is available to them to use, they also wanted to do their own research and analysis and I --

1:29:13 Woman: Because there's no consequences. There's never a consequence. They can backpedal. They don't have to meet the criteria because they might possibly get a slap on the wrist. I'm not criticizing you, but this is how it's working. And now they've been given the opportunity to have the money to fund these upgrades and to silence their neighbors instead of going on social media spending their time shouting down all the neighbors, saying that we're just complaining, they were here first, we're just complaining about smell.

1:29:51 We're concerned about our health. We're not joking when we're saying about vomiting and migraines. We don't know, because nobody's done air quality tests, water tests. We bring it up at the meetings. Nobody's doing it. Nobody has a guide for us to head to that direction. So you have a community who is hurting medically, physically, and you have a company that will not do anything on their own. That's incredibly discouraging.

1:30:24 Hila Ritter: Yeah, thank you for sharing that, and I hear you. And that's why we have these proposed amendments, where we are severely limiting the pile size and making it a very different landscape by the end of next year.

Woman: Well I hope we're here.

Kendall Martin: We have one question here in the queue and then I'll come back over this way.

1:30:47 Woman: Okay, I'll be really quick. I just -- Dwayne, my friend, he's my email pal, but no longer. I divorced him. Only because I was faithfully reporting odors, really bad odors. It was on a daily basis. And I thought well maybe I'll just report when it's not smelly, which I couldn't do -- because I could never figure out a time in town where I was that it didn't smell. So even if it didn't smell at my house, on my way to work I could smell it, with all my windows closed and this and that. So I just want to go on record. This is a comment.

1:31:18 And I told Dwayne, I didn't feel safe to report because of the bullying on social media. And it's, you know, and then I was doubted that I smelled the smell and I was like "Are you kidding me?" And then I quit. So that's the seriousness of it. You guys aren't -- people are done reporting. We're done. We've reported faithfully. So don't assume that -- and I've said that to you, too, Dwayne, and you've been awesome, a pen pal, I really appreciate all your help.

1:31:47 But don't assume that -- it smells every day somewhere within a five-mile radius. And it doesn't matter which way the wind is blowing or if it's not blowing. So I'm not reporting any more.

Hila Ritter: Yeah. And I think that speaks to the importance of the community engagement plan and opening up the doors a little bit and showing people what's happening on site, what the plans are going forward. And I think that that's going to do a lot for both the community and for Grimm's Fuel Company.

1:32:21 Woman: Who's facilitating that meeting?

Hila Ritter: Metro is requiring the facility to come up with a community engagement plan and ---

Woman: Okay, well if it's on social media just forget it because it's gotten really nasty, very nasty.

Hila Ritter: No, it's something like -- something to include facility to informational tours of the facility, open houses of the facility.

Man: Specific tactics that are tangible to --

1:32:48 Hila Ritter: A good neighbor agreement that is an agreement that is written by community representatives and Grimm's Fuel Company, where they both come to agreement on that. Metro won't facilitate that, but I have resources to help. There are mediators and facilitators that we can turn on to help with that process.

1:33:13 Woman: Yeah, I just wanted to comment. Somebody else commented on this about the being sick. And I go out and walk dogs in the morning -- my dog [indistinct] -- I get very sick because I've got a very sensitive situation. So, you know, I get sick when I go outside in that and it's not fair that we have to do that. That we're always not feeling good. And I live in Angel haven, which is a 55 and over community and we have people there that have oxygen that have to go outside a lot of times to get their exercise and they complain about how the smell affects their body.

1:33:46 It has to affect the body. And you guys have to listen to this. You have to check in on us. You have to talk to us about his. How is this affecting us. Because it is. And you can't do that to senior people. It's just not right. You're forgetting us. Because you're not living in the area. Most of you probably don't live in our area. And sometimes I'll come from -- I play a lot of tennis and stuff -- I come from my club and I'll smell the darn thing about way -- maybe 2, 3 miles down when I'm coming into the area. But when right here in the area, it just permeates and --

1:34:23 Person: Someone on 134th Terrace just sold their house because they're tired of this.

Woman: And we've had a lot of people do that in the --

Person: They are tired of this. Four homes sold in the last 30, 90 days.

Woman: Yeah, we've had a lot of [indistinct] been thinking about it too.

1:34:38 Hila Ritter: Yeah, and you know, to both of your comments -- I understand the fatigue and, you know, even when there aren't reports we know -- we're continuing to push forward on this and too, you know, to seek your input. It's guided our process and I know you're worn out and all I can do is say thank you for your continued engagement, and we're listening.

1:35:06 Woman: Well [indistinct] haven't reported for a long time, either.

Hila Ritter: And that's okay. We're still --

[cross talk]

Man: Dwayne is still out there, whether you're sending him emails or not.

Woman: Okay.

Man: It's not entirely complaint-based.

Kendall Martin: I have a hand back there and then I'll come back to Ted.

Woman: Are reports public? The reports that we made, are they public information?

1:35:30 Hila Ritter: Yes, they are public information. Everything that's submitted to Metro is public information. So on the web form that we have, if you want to -- if you don't want to include your name or your contact information, you don't have to. It's ideal if you do --

Man: You can't hit submit unless you fill out --

Hila Ritter: You have to include your email. You have to include an email address if you submit it on line.

1:35:53 Woman: I just wanted to make a point that again, showing their commitment to their citizens on the community Facebook group, Grimm's family members have gone on and posted the names of the people that have complained.

People: That's not true.

1:36:10 Woman: Well, I have screen shots of it. [cross talk] So that would really cut back on people's willingness to come forward. And we [indistinct] the same things when we're trying to discuss even having a meeting in our community. Trying just to engage people to show up. And so to me it seems like the idea is to shut people down -- to shame them, to embarrass them, to tell them that what they're experiencing isn't happening -- so that we're quiet and we stop bothering them. And that's not going to happen. Because we need to breathe here and I have -- we've all seen it. Many of us have seen that.

1:36:47 Hila Ritter: I'm sorry.

Woman: Well that's not your control but that tells me a lot about the people [indistinct].

Hila Ritter: Well, I am not on the social media so I can't speak to any of that but when a complaint comes in to us, to Metro, we share that information with Grimm's Fuel Company. So again, if you don't want your contact information shared, leave it out. But we share that information with Grimm's Fuel Company, because they are required in their license to track it and to respond to it. So they often respond back to us and include the --

1:37:32 Woman: So on the form -- I have not submitted a form -- when you go online to submit a form, does it tell you that this is going to be public information and that the company that you're reporting that on will be receiving it? Great.

Hila Ritter: Yeah. And so they respond to it. And oftentimes what their staff who goes around and does odor audits, as well, what they experience is different than what the person who submitted the complaint was and so in their response when they are reporting to Metro what their observations were - it may or may not align with what the person who complained experienced.

1:38:20 So I have seen that. And that is often frustrating to the person who experienced this and then they're seeing that being refuted. It's -- as a public agency we are listening to all of the folks that want to submit information to us. So that the Grimm's is required to respond and to record their observations. And when those are in contrast to what folks are experiencing, I can understand that that's a very frustrating experience.

1:38:58 Kendall Martin: Thank you. We have Ted. One more question there, and then we're going to start closing it down, we're about 15 minutes out from [indistinct].

Man: [indistinct] what is the next step so the neighbors know what's going on and what's happening. So in that case a lot of questions could be answered.

Hila Ritter: That's a great idea for the community engagement plan. Good idea.

1:39:35 Woman: So, I understand the public comment's open till November 30? And then will you tell us about what the next steps are for Metro after that and then if there's separate next steps on the DEQ part, what those are.

Hila Ritter: Yeah, so for Metro we're going to compile all of the comments and analyze them and finish the rest of the license. As I said there's this section that we have here, a portion of it. There are other small changes that are going throughout -- grammatical changes and formatting changes and such -- to get it, you know, a little more modernized with some -- with our language moving forward.

1:40:17 So, finish that. Write the staff report. And publish those things. And then the license will be effective January 1 for metro. And then we are going to participate with DEQ in their process going forward.

Man: Yeah, DEQ process write a modified permit proposal, a modified permit and open it up to public comment. [indistinct] time line [indistinct].

Woman: We're hoping to have a public comment period started by the end of November. And then we would put that [indistinct] [cross talk].

Kendall Martin: Sir.

1:41:01 David Guard: I'm David Guard and I'm fairly new to the community. I just want to offer a couple of observations, as somebody that's brand new to this whole process. We've lived here for three years. We've dealt with this stuff for three years. It's frustrating. I can't imagine how frustrating you must be if you've been here with it for a long time and so I'd

[indistinct]. But I also want to say that I'm encouraged -- because yes, there are weasel bumps. There are also really specific sorts of things. Those are measurable. Those are things that you can measure. You can see if it's happening.

1:41:35 There are suggestions that it is going to move from an anaerobic to an aerobic -- I'm not sure exactly what all that means, but apparently that's going to mitigate a lot of the smell. I think there are steps that are being taken that I see as positive. I think that needs to be recognized. There's obviously a lot of emotion on both sides. I want to just say I'm impressed by the expression by the -- the work that's been done by all you folks, by the [indistinct] the frustration that's been expressed and the deeply felt emotions.

1:42:11 But also to say that I think something's happening. And I think there are commitments to being changed. There were pictures up there of some things that Grimm's had done that can't not have been cheap. They've made some commitments. But anyhow, so I just wanted to say from my observation I think that progress is being made and --.

1:42:32 Kendall Martin: Thank you. Appreciate that. So, as our next step, we talked about what Metro is committed to doing, what DEQ is committed to doing. I can tell you from my chair sitting in the communications department at Metro, we're committed to keep talking. We're committed to keep listening to you. This is about advocacy. This is the only way that things change. We need to hear from you. Not just at this meeting. It's your friends and neighbors, lobbyists, advocate with us. Send us emails.

1:43:04 Let us know what is happening on the ground. I heard earlier tonight that all hope might be lost in connecting with us and letting us know where you're at. That's not how change happens. Change happens over time with small movements that come to big movements. And that's you sitting in this room and letting other people know that there are resources. There is a process. And there's some human beings in here that give a damn. We're your government. We're fighting for you. So we need to hear from you. Please keep that up.

1:43:35 One thing I want to recall is the fact that your comments on these comment cards. This is how you affect change. Please take the time, visit our website, make your comments. Send in a comment. You met Hila tonight. She's the person that's going to be reading what you have to submit. You know someone at Metro that is responsive and listening to you. Please take the time and share that with your friends and neighbors. That's how we're going to work together.

1:44:03 If there are any other questions, please let us know. Now's an open moment for closing comments. I don't know if you want to make a statement, or DEQ if there's any closing comment statement that you want to make, but --

Hila Ritter: Yeah, sure, I'll just follow up and reiterate what Kendall said. And, thank you. It really does help us to hear from you and I know this has been a long process but we're in it with you. And, thank you.

Woman: Can you just be sure to ask [sounds like] Senator Wegner-Heim for the list because we have not been getting notifications of these meetings [indistinct].

Hila Ritter: Sure.

[cross talk]

Man: Can I ask a question about going forward?

Woman: Okay.

1:44:51 Man: The operations plan, the license seems to depend a lot on the operations plan. It delegates a lot of the details of it. Will Metro commit to having the public involved in the process [indistinct] the initial operations plan, and changes to it?

Woman: No.

Man: Why not?

Woman: Because we are your government that is responsible for overseeing the solid waste system and the reviewing and approving of the operations plan is part of our purview.

Man: So the license is our only -- that's where we can help get stuff in there.

1:45:35 Woman: I guess I'll change my no to a maybe. I guess I can't say no. Maybe. We have not in the past. The approval of the operating plan has not been something that has been part of public notice there or public comment of subject to public input.

Kendall Martin: It is subject to public disclosure, so once you can see it --

Man: After it's been approved.

1:46:06 Kendall Martin: Yeah, and if there's an issue you can raise it to us and we can address it. So it's something that the public will get access to.

Woman: Like the word minimize and revising some of that and things like that, right? Correct?

Woman: Yeah.

Woman: So I think you heard that about three ways tonight then, yeah.

Kendall Martin: But don't stop there. Please make a public comment. That's how we -- we heard you in the notes.

Woman: I'll send you a card.

1:46:30 Kendall Martin: That's also great. Appreciate it. This is how we have to do things. So without further ado I want to thank you all for attending tonight. Thank you for the spirit. Thank you for the openness and thank you for being kind. It is so important that you continue to talk to us, hold us accountable. Thank you very much, we're adjourned.

[applause]

[cross talk]

[end of file]